REVISITING MANILA'S CLUP IN PREPARATION FOR CLIMATE CHANGE AND A MORE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GROWTH PATTERN

Asst. Prof. Sylvia D. Clemente, uap, piep

Outline

- Salient Features of MCLUPZO
- Definition of Risk, Hazards, Exposure, & Vulnerability
- MMDA's Metropolitan Manila Earthquake Impact Reduction Study (MMEIRS)
- NDRRMC's GMMA Risk Analysis Project
 Policy Recommendations

What is the Comprehensive Land Use Plan (CLUP)?

For guiding, regulating growth and development of a city or municipality.

The CLUP document includes:

- 1. The Comprehensive Development Land Use Plan
- 2. Zoning Ordinance
- 3. Sectoral Studies (a documentation of the supporting studies that were undertaken to arrive at the resultant CLUP).

MCLUPZO COMPREHENSIVE LAND USE PLAN AND ZONING ORDINANCE

OFFICIAL ZONING MAP 2005-2020







PALAFOX ASSOCIATES Internet + Longer Land, Particular Construction of Constructio advalue ing

determination in the second se

FELHO A. PALAFOX JR. ROBERTO R. AMORES MR. LOURDES "BOWLEY" M. ISIP- GARELE ARIA THEREDA B. 90H04H-04V10

JOSE L. ATIENZA JE.

MCLUPZO -







OFFICIAL

110,000 (0)

LAND USE ALLOCATION 1981 Zoning, Existing Land Use, 2005-2020 Land Use and Zoning

ZONES	% share			
ZONES	1981	Existing	2005-2020	
Residential	5.15	35.84	20.69	
Commercial	34.38	13.44	41.01	
Industrial	19.26	5.26	2.31	
Institutional	5.76	12.06	18.62	
Parks and Open Spaces	4.88	7.95	6.17	
Cultural	2.26	0	overlay	
infrastructure and Utilities	24.62	25.45	11.20	
APD	3.69	*	as new PUD	
TOTAL	100	100	100	
TOTAL LAND AREA (ha)	3085	4045	4192.25	

Source: Digital Land Use Map ** same as 1981 Zoning



Projects/Programs: LRT4, Old Bilibid, Overlay zoning of Historic district/APD/PUD, TDR, FAR bonus incentives , Pasig River Ferry system, Port modernization



RISK SPACE



Risk – likelihood of harm, loss, disaster

Hazard – physical impact of a disturbance

Exposure – elements (people, property, systems) affected by the hazard

Vulnerability – lack of capacity of community to prepare, absorb, recover from hazard

RISK = Hazard x Exposure x Vulnerability

Source: Vulnerability Assessment, Dr. Rosa Perez , 2011

Rankings on Risks to Disasters

United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (UNESCAP) (2015)

 <u>Philippines 3rd on a list of countries most prone to</u> <u>natural disasters for the past 45 years</u> including exposures to earthquakes, storms, floods, droughts and sea level rise.

Swiss re (2014)

<u>Manila placed as the 2nd highest in the world out of the 10 cities most at risk of being hit by natural disasters</u> based on aggregated potential risks from earthquakes, storms, storm surges, tsunamis, and river floods.

Metro Manila Earthquake Impact Reduction Study (MMEIRS) (2004)

Three (3) Models (for earthquake ground motion, liquefaction potential, slope stability and estimation of tsunami height):

- Marikina West Valley Faults (MWVF) with a Magnitude of 7.2
- 2. Manila Trench with a Magnitude of 7.9
- 3. Manila Bay with a Magnitude of 6.5.



Possible regional separation by earthquake impact

These were based on three susceptibility measures-<u>flammability, building</u> <u>collapse, and evacuation</u> <u>difficulty.</u>



Flammability

The areas in **Manila are** found vulnerable to flammability.



Evacuation difficulty

The areas in Manila are found vulnerable to evacuation difficulty.



Comprehensive regional vulnerability

- Highest deaths from collapse of buildings Manila & Quezon City
- Manila Bay area will be isolated from other parts of Metro Manila due to fire and building collapse.
- Safe ground for the West quadrant (Manila) 23 has. Intramuros Golf course
- Emergency road/access network Roxas Boulevard, Taft Avenue & Pasig River

- Evacuation facility shortage Manila North Port Area & south eastern Manila City area
 Public schools
 - colleges (2km. radius)
 - secondary schools (1 km. radius)
 - elementary schools (0.5 km. radius)

 Hospital Service shortage – South eastern Manila City area

 Manila City and adjacent area have certain levels of service; however, there is a <u>high probability of</u> <u>hospitals burning due to fire.</u>

 Evacuation area shortage – along Manila Bay, Manila North Port area, south eastern Manila City area

 Open space and parks (at least 2 has.) – correlated to no. of seriously damaged bldgs. and service area density of parks and open spaces.

Risk Analysis Project Multi-Hazard & Risk Maps

Greater Metropolitan Manila Area (GMMA) Risk Analysis Project (2013)

Agencies: NDRRMC, PHIVOLCS, DENR-MGB, DND, PAGASA, NAMRIA, AUSAID, & Australian Gov't.

LIDAR Data

- Laser scanning device
- Maps out:
 - Population density
 - Building density
 - Building heights
 - Age & type of buildings
 - Current land use
- Flood, earthquake, severe wind

Measuring Risks

Damage to physical elements
Economic loss
Number of fatalities/injured

A RISK ANALYSIS PROJECT: GROUND SHAKING HAZARD MAP EVENT SCENARIO: MAGNITUDE 7.2 EARTHQUAKE ALONG THE WEST VALLEY FAULT

	CAPUED OF THE ALL OF T
KD'LEGEND (PEIS) icale	1. This is a composite map of estimates of maximum intensities for various earthquake scenarios that may affect the study area. Intensities were determined using a deterministic method. Fault parameters and maximum credible magnitude used for different earthquake scenario were based on instrumental seismicity, historical seismicity and mapped active earthquake generators in the area. The attenuation of groundshaking with distance was corrected for the type of underlying materials based on surface geology and or results of microtremor surveys. 2. The groundshaking hazard maps do not restrict construction of any structure or land development in areas with expected high intensities as long as the national building code is followed. 3. This map is ideal for land use, emergency response and mitigation planning, but should not replace site specific evaluations for the building of critical structures.
	T. E. LEGASPY

VOLCS Earthquake Intensity

Intensity 6

Intensity 7

Intensity Low 8

Intensity High 8

Intensity Low 9

Intensity High 9

🔁 READY FOR GMMA PROJECT : PRELIMINARY STORM SURGE HAZARD MAP



AREADY FOR GMMA PROJECT : PRELIMINARY LIQUEFACTION HAZARD MAP

SAT

MANDA

MAKAŤ

MANILA

High Susceptibility Moderate Susceptibility

Low Susceptibility

 The map was based on the geology, earthquake source zone, historical accounts of liquefaction, geomorphology and hydrology of the area, and preliminary microtremor survey data utilized to validate type of underlying materials.

 This map is semi-detailed and may be used for land use, emergency response and mitigation planning, and should not be used for site specific evaluation.

3. The liquefaction hazard maps do not restrict construction of any structures and development in areas susceptible to liquefaction as long as proper engineering considerations are applied.

🔁 READY FOR GMMA PROJECT : PRELIMINARY TSUNAMI HAZARD MAP



ARISK ANALYSIS PROJECT: SEVERE WIND HAZARD MAP EVENT SCENARIO: 5% ANNUAL EXCEEDANCE PROBABILITY (1/20)



60 - 100

101 - 140

141 - 170

171 - 200

201 - 230

> 230

RISK ANALYSIS PROJECT: SEVERE WIND RISK MAP 5% ANNUAL EXCEEDANCE PROBABILITY: BUILDING DAMAGED FLOOR AREA EQUIVALENT



RISK ANALYSIS PROJECT: TOTAL FLOOR AREA IN COLLAPSED DAMAGE STATE PER BARANGAY FOR A MAGNITUDE 7.2 WEST VALLEY FAULT EARTHQUAKE



High Complete Collapse Damage Density



Sampaloc district along España blvd. Data obtained from *Google Maps*, 2015.

Tondo (brgys. 67, 70, 79, 109, & 111). Data obtained from *Google Maps, 2015*

High Complete Collapse Damage Density



Ermita, with its numerous commercial, institutional, and office buildings such as Robinson's Place Manila, Hyatt Regency Hotel, Pan Pacific Manila, Diamond Hotel, Ramon Magsaysay Center, Phil. General Hospital. Data obtained from *Google Maps, 2015*.

Malate (brgy. 752). Data obtained from *Google Maps*, 2015.



High Complete Collapse Damage Density



Binondo is a highly-densed commercial area with its old and new commercial malls such as Divisoria Mall, 168 Mall, Lucky Chinatown Mall, etc. and also new residential and office towers rising in the district. Data obtained from *Google Maps*, 2015

Malate (brgys. 707, 708, 709, & 715, & 727). Data obtained from *Google Maps*, *2015*. Located in the area are: Enrique M. Razon Sports Center, Ninoy Aquino Stadium, Rizal Memorial Track and Football Stadium, De La Salle University, Harrison Plaza, and Century Park Hotel.



RISK ANALYSIS PROJECT: ESTIMATED NUMBER OF FATALITIES PER BARANGAY FOR A MAGNITUDE 7.2 VALLEY FAULT EARTHQUAKE



RISK ANALYSIS PROJECT: ESTIMATED NUMBER OF LIFE THREATENING INJURIES PER BARANGAY FOR A MAGNITUDE 7.2 VALLEY FAULT EARTHQUAKE



RISK ANALYSIS PROJECT: TOTAL FLOOR AREA IN EXTENSIVE DAMAGE STATE PER BARANGAY FOR A MAGNITUDE 7.2 WEST VALLEY FAULT EARTHQUAKE

BAYANI

SAN

MANDAL

MAKATI

Violet – Binondo, Ermita, Phil. Normal U.(?), UP-PGH(?), Malate

Ermita, Paco, and Malate. Data obtained f Google Maps, 2015.

RISK LEGEND

(in 10,000 sq.m. of floor area per 1 sq.km. barangay area)

0, No Damage

- 1 30, Low Extensive Damage Density
- 31 60, Moderate Extensive Damage Density
- 61 90, High Extensive Damage Density

more than 90, Very High Extensive Damage Density

EXPLANATION

The earthquake risk maps were prepared using a Magnitude 7.2 earthquake scenario from the Valley Fault System, an exposure database developed using an area-based approach and vulnerability and fragility curves developed by engineers for Philippine building types.

*as of June 2013

MANILA

ERMA

RISK ANALYSIS PROJECT: ESTIMATED ECONOMIC LOSS PER BARANGAY FOR A MAGNITUDE 7.2 WEST VALLEY FAULT EARTHQUAKE



AREADY FOR GMMA PROJECT : PRELIMINARY FLOOD HAZARD MAP





ARISK ANALYSIS PROJECT: FLOOD HAZARD MAP EVENT SCENARIO: 20% ANNUAL EXCEEDANCE PROBABILITY (1/5)

LERMA

MANILA

LEVERUZ

BAYANI

MAKAT

SAI

MANDAL

Ermita, Intramuros, Pandacan, Sta. Mesa

0.1 - 0.5 Ankle deep - Knee deep	

0.5 - 1.0 Knee deep - Waist deep

1.0 - 2.0 Waist deep - Top of head deep

2.0 - 3.0 Top of head deep - 1-storey high

3.0 - 4.0 1-storey high - 1.5-storeys high

> 4.0 1.5-storeys high or higher

Based on hypothetical combination of input rainfall time series, high Laguna lake level and high water in Manila Bay, hazard scenarios are developed and transformed into flood inundation map using rainfall runoff model (HEC-HMS) and hydraulic model (HEC-RAS). In Taguig-Pateros region, degree of flooding is significantly influenced by assuming the performance of flood defence structures along Laguna lake.

EXPLANATIO

RADIAL ROAD

ARISK ANALYSIS PROJECT: FLOOD RISK MAP 20% ANNUAL EXCEEDANCE PROBABILITY (1/5) : BUILDING DAMAGE COST

Dark green – Tondo, Binondo, Ermita, San Miguel, Sta. Mesa, Pandacan

1 - 5

5 - 10

10 - 15

15 - 20

20 - 25

> 25



RISK ANALYSIS PROJECT: FLOOD RISK MAP 20% ANNUAL EXCEEDANCE PROBABILITY (1/5) : POPULATION WITH INUNDATED HOMES

Red – along esteros - Tondo, PNR Blumentritt, along esteros (Sta. Ana, Malate)

POPULATION WITH INUNDATED HOMES

(Thousands of People / km^2)

1 - 20

20 - 40

40 - 60

60 - 80

80 - 100

>100



A RISK ANALYSIS PROJECT: FLOOD RISK MAP 20% ANNUAL EXCEEDANCE PROBABILITY (1/5) : DAMAGED FLOOR AREA EQUIVALENT Q Ap BAYANI RADIAL ROAD 1 LERMA SAN J ME MANILA 1APA JESUS 8 MANDALU AFT AVE This map estimates the degree of building damage caused by a flood Damaged Floor Area Equivalent (ha./sq.km.) which has a 20% probability of occurrence every year. It is derived by combining the results of a flood model with information on the building types and their susceptibility to flooding. 1-5 MABI 5 - 10 SUPERI 10 - 15 AVE LEVERIZA 15 - 20 INE GAR 18ANTO 20 - 25 FTAVE MAKATI > 25

ARISK ANALYSIS PROJECT: FLOOD HAZARD MAP EVENT SCENARIO: 1% ANNUAL EXCEEDANCE PROBABILITY (1/100)

				OULD ON THE
		1		1
0.1 - 0.5 Ankle deep - Knee deep	Based on hypothetical combination of input rainfall time series, high Laguna lake level and high water in Manila Bay, hazard scenarios	mt f		PASICALVER
0.5 - 1.0 Knee deep - Waist deep	are developed and transformed into flood inundation map using rainfall runoff model (HEC-HMS) and hydraulic model (HEC-RAS). In Taguig-Pateros region, degree of flooding is significantly	H I		
1.0 - 2.0 Waist deep - Top of head deep	influenced by assuming the performance of flood defence structures along Laguna lake.	A.M.B.		44
2.0 - 3.0 Top of head deep - 1-storey high			JAN F	
3.0 - 4.0 1-storey high - 1.5-storeys high		Lit		AS
> 4.0 1.5-storeys high or higher		T	MAP	ATI

Recommendations Applying CCA-DRRM policies & sustainable design principles in urban planning

- Inclusion of Hazard overlays on the identified high-risk prone areas that will have its own Risk Sensitive Zoning Ordinance, e.g., seismic zoning map based on expected peak ground acceleration especially for areas covered within the 10 km. distance from the MWVF.
- Auditing of existing individual structures within the high-risk areas and retrofit and upgrade those that do not meet the minimum national building and structural codes.
 - Priority on gov't. structures, utilities, infrastructure
 - IEC

• Provision of some form of economic and financial assistance to make the technology easily accessible to the private sector in retrofitting their structures.

 Repossession of encroached areas along the rivers and esteros to allow for proper flood control management and protection of structures constructed along the water easement especially, along the identified high-risk flood prone areas.

 Ensuring the strictest implementation of the standards and guidelines on those covered under the Risk Sensitive Zoning Ordinance. Future developments should be compliant to these higher standards and, if needed, the government may resort to the use of police powers to protect public interest.

• Use of performance standards vis-a-vis design standards.

• Fostering of a political environment that will encourage the private sector and the local stakeholders to meaningfully participate in the planning of their communities. This means transparency in the planning process (e.g., conducting public consultations and hearings), full accountability of local officials, and active participation and involvement of the public in the local projects/programs.

 Review of the economic incentives in the Zoning ordinance such as bonus Floor Area Ratio (FAR), Transfer of Development Rights (TDR), idle land's tax, etc.

 Looking at other best practices in planning that can be possible models for solving Manila's urban blight problems like creation of Tax Increment Financing (TIF) districts for large scale urban renewal projects, Adequate Public Facilities Ordinance (APFO), Impact Fees, among other things.

 Generating more open space than what is recommended in the MCLUPZO. If Manila is to continue its growth plan and embark on densification, then there should be a corresponding need to expand and create more green and open space.

• Preservation of the local identity and culture of the City by strengthening its "imageability" in urban design, etc.

- Creating institutions and upgrading emergency facilities in light of new studies from NDRRMC.
 - Strengthening the lifeline/emergency facilities such as power, water, sewage, telecommunications & road networks; and to the extent possible, creation of service redundancies
 - Mobilization of the entire community and institutionalization of CCA-DRRM programs thru massive IEC, inclusion in the curriculum of schools, regular conduct of emergency and evacuation drills resulting in the community's internalization of the programs.

• Enforcement of the "rule of law" and exercise of political will. The LGU should monitor and enforce the laws especially on the zoning ordinances, building code, fire code, structural code, water code, etc.

 Designating conservation easements and protected areas with the highest development restrictions and regulations to mitigate negative impacts of natural hazards in those areas, e.g. Manila Bay, Pasig River, esteros,

 Promotion and provision of incentives for buildings and developments that adapt green architecture and sustainable design features to lessen the "Urban Heat Island Effect" and improve the urban design of the city.

 Making available public housing, revisiting "people's plan initiatives", and exploring alternative approaches to affordable housing to address the housing problem.

 Coordination with the national government in the planning and implementation of key programs and infrastructure projects, e.g. LRT4, Old Bilibid Prison

Future Challenges & Issues

 The existing urban problems of flooding, traffic, non-conforming land uses, environmental degradation, and urban blight, demand serious attention if Manila is to compete in the global community.

• Social equity, environmental protection, and economic viability should be the key guiding principles in planning for our cities.

Bibliography

- AUSAID, NDRRMC, UNDP, & et. al. (2013). *Risk Analysis Project: Multi-Hazard & Risk Maps for Greater Metro Manila Area.*
- Housing and Land Use Regulatory Board (HLURB). (2006). *A Guide to Comprehensive Land Use Plan Preparation*.
- Housing and Land Use Regulatory Board (HLURB). (2014). Supplemental Guidebook on Mainstreaming Climate and Disaster Risks in the Comprehensive Land Use Plan (draft copy)
- Manila City Planning Development Office (CPDO). (2006). *Manila Comprehensive Land Use Plan Zoning Ordinance (MCLUPZO)* 2005-2020.
- Metropolitan Manila Development Authority, Phil. Institute of Volcanology and Seismology, Japan International Cooperation Authority. (2004) *Metropolitan Manila Earthquake Impact Reduction Study (MMEIRS)*.
- United Nations Office for Disaster Risk Reduction. Hyogo Framework for Action 2005-2015: Building the Resilience of Nations and Communities to Disasters.

Disclaimer: Some of the photos were taken as screen shots from the internet and are not owned by the author.